

BUSINESS & MANAGEMENT STUDIES:

AN INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL

Vol.:8 Issue:2 Year:2020, 2019-2043

<u>Citation:</u> Önez Çetin Z., The International Migration In Turkey And Local Governments, BMIJ, (2020), 8(2): 2019-2043 doi: <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.15295/bmij.v8i2.1481</u>

THE INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION IN TURKEY AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS

Zuhal Önez ÇETİN¹

Received Date (Başvuru Tarihi): 20/04/2020

Accepted Date (Kabul Tarihi): 16/05/2020

Published Date (Yayın Tarihi): 25/06/2020

ABSTRACT

Keywords:

Migration International Migration Local Governments Municipal Administrations Regional Refugee & Resilience Plans

JEL Codes:

H1, H7

Local governments at the global and national level faced difficulties at the provision of local services owing to the raise in the population a result of the international migration. In that context, local governments are the closest administrative units for citizens and the demand towards the local services has raised with the arrival of the migrants. In the study, firstly, the concepts of migration, international migration, migration management and migrant have been explained. Secondly, the local governments' role has assessed on migration at the international and national level. On that scope, the local governments' role in related to migration has been searched with using the document analysis method and the significant documents such as the workshops' Reports in related to migration in Turkey, The Grand National Assembly of Turkey 'Migration and Cohesion' Report (2018) and Regional Refugee & Resilience Plans (3RP) prepared from 2015 to 2020 country chapters in related to Turkey have been searched. In the study, the target is to examine local governments' role on the issue of migration, the main problem areas of local governments on that issue and the solution proposals towards those problems. In the last part of the study, some proposals have been made for the local governments on the issue of international migration.

TÜR<mark>KİYE'DE U</mark>LUSLARARASI GÖÇ VE YEREL YÖNETİMLER

ÖΖ

Anahtar Kelimeler: Göç Uluslararası Göç Yerel Yönetimler Belediye Yönetimleri Bölgesel Mülteci ve Dayanıklılık Planları JEL Kodları:

H1, H7

Küresel ve ulusal düzeydeki yerel yönetimler, uluslararası göçün bir sonucu olarak nüfusun artması nedeniyle yerel hizmetlerin sunulmasında güçlüklerle karşılaşmaktadır. Bu bağlamda, yerel yönetimler vatandaşlar için en yakın idari birimlerdir ve göçmenlerin gelişiyle yerel hizmetlere olan talep artmıştır. Çalışmada, ilk olarak göç, uluslararası göç, göç yönetimi ve göçmen kavramları açıklanmıştır. İkinci olarak, yerel yönetimlerin göç konusunda rolü uluslararası ve ulusal düzeyde değerlendirilmiştir. Bu kapsamda, yerel yönetimlerin göçle ilgili rolü, döküman analizi yöntemi kullanılarak araştırılmıştır ve Türkiye'de göçle ilgili çalıştay Raporları, Türkiye Büyük Millet Meclisi 'Göç ve Uyum Raporu' (2018) ve 2015'ten 2020 yılına kadar hazırlanmış olan Bölgesel Mülteci ve Dayanıklılık Planları (3RP)'nın Türkiye ile ilgili ülke bölümleri gibi önemli belgeler incelenmiştir. Çalışmada hedef, yerel yönetimlerin göç konusundaki rolünü, yerel yönetimlerin bu konudaki temel sorun alanlarını ve bu sorunlara yönelik çözüm önerilerini incelemektir. Çalışmanın son bölümünde, yerel yönetimler için uluslararası göç konusunda bazı önerilerde bulunulmuştur.

¹ Dr. Öğretim Üyesi, Uşak Üniversitesi, İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi, Kamu Yönetimi Bölümü, Yerel Yönetimler ABD Başkanı, <u>zuhal.cetin@usak.edu.tr</u>, <u>https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4241-1487</u>

Business & Management Studies: An International Journal Vol.:8 Issue:2 Year:2020, 2019-2043

Bu makale, araştırma ve yayın etiğine uygun hazırlanmış ve **Iterative** intihal taramasından geçirilmiştir.

1. INTRODUCTION

The estimated international migrants' number has augmented for the five decades (IOM UN Migration, 2020: 21). The population of the international migrant has augmented in size at the global scale; however, it stayed stable as a ratio of the population of the world (IOM UN Migration, 2020: 22). Besides, Turkey was illustrated as the largest host country in the year 2018 at the world for the fifth successive year with the proportion of 3.7 million refugees and that ratio is mostly covering Syrians (IOM UN Migration, 2020: 40). At the distribution of Syrian foreigners registered according to the end of the year 2016 by gender, 1,323,054 of 2,834,441 Syrian foreigners are indicated as women and 1,511,387 are illustrated as men (Turkish Republic Ministry of Internal Affairs, General Directorate of Migration Management, 2016: 77). Besides, in the distribution of the provinces, Istanbul was the first province with 438.861, Şanlıurfa with 405.511 and Hatay with 379.141 in the third place (Turkish Republic Ministry of Internal Affairs, General Directorate of Migration Management, 2016: 77).

Turkey is in the country of a target and transit country, a target country as to the reasons of its geographical location and the political, social and economic problems in the surrounding countries, and a transit country owing to the fact that it acts as a bridge in terms of transportation of foreign nationals to European countries; and Turkey has not only a very long land and sea borders but also it is located in a geographical location where there are many border neighbours that those reveal the potential of Turkey in the field of migration (Turkish Republic Ministry of Internal Affairs, General Directorate of Migration Management, 2016: 56).

The developments in neighbouring countries of Turkey pave the way for the change of Turkey's role in migration and asylum (Ekşi, 2016: 11). In related to the migration of Syrians in Turkey, in the Report titled 'Migration And Cohesion' of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (2018: 243), it is emphasized that the first migration in related to Syrians to Turkey launched in the year of 2011 and the number of the Syrians who came to Turkey continued to rise in years as to the sustenance of

the civil war and the increasing of its severity. At that Related Report, it is added that Turkey regarding the refugee population is at located at a position that hosts the biggest population of refugee in the world (The Grand National Assembly of Turkey, 2018: 243). In the Report of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (2018: 244), it is also explained that the registered Syrians living in our country are in temporary protection status and it is pointed out that the people, who are included in temporary protection, are provided with opportunities such as health, social assistance and services, marriage, education, subscription and vehicle registration, access to labor market, in the provinces where they reside.

In that scope, Turkey's policy on Syrians that have been implemented since April 2011 are determined to have three main foundation and these related dimensions is clarified as the policy of open door, the principle of non-refoulement and temporary protection status that is given to Syrians (Erdoğan, 2016: 31). The international migration and the refugee issue intensified at the big cities and those issues become more visible in the public sphere that those issues paved the way for local governments to think, to produce various solutions or to take some measures on the issue of international migration and the refugee (Daudov, 2015: 3). On that scope, Kahraman et. al. (2019: 47) clarified that *"the problems experienced by foreign migrants in urban spaces and urban services in countries that experience global migration movements in ordinary and extraordinary ways affect various dimensions up to the social peace and security of that city. At this point, it is necessary to acknowledge that local governments have several tasks to undertake".*

In this sense, many municipal administrations at the provincial level and metropolitan municipalities deal with the local policies towards the migrants and refugees in Turkey. The main objective of the study is to examine the role of the local governments, and especially the municipal administrations on international migration in Turkey.

Within the context of the study, firstly the main concepts of migration, international migration, migration management and migrant have explained. Secondly, the local governments' role has evaluated on migration at the international

and national level. In that regard, the local governments' role in related to migration has searched with using the document analysis method (no ethics committee permit is required) and critical documents such as the workshops' Reports in related to migration in Turkey, the Grand National Assembly of Turkey 'Migration and Cohesion' Report (2018) and Regional Refugee & Resilience Plans (3RP) prepared from 2015 to 2020 country chapters in related to Turkey have been searched.

In the study, the critical objective is to examine local governments' role on the issue of migration, the main problem areas of local governments and solution proposals towards those problems. Lastly, some proposals have been made for the local administrations on the issue of international migration.

2. THE CONCEPTS OF MIGRATION, INTERNATIONAL MIGRATION AND MIGRATION MANAGEMENT

The concept of migration does not have a single and definitive definition as to those following reasons such as its multidimensional structure and tied to this, the entrance of migration to those related disciplines' working areas such as demography, economy, sociology, anthropology, history, political science, psychology, and geography (Kahraman, Coşkun and Tunç, 2002: 25). In that context, characterizing a population movement as migration, it should include some elements; these are elucidated as; the necessity of the movement as a result of the population movement realized with migration should occur between two different settlements and within a certain period of time (Ertan and Ertan, 2017: 11).

At that framework, migration is identified by "Displacement of a person or group of people crossing an international border or within a State. Whatever the duration, structure, and cause, it is the population movements where people move. This includes migration of refugees, displaced persons, economic migrants, people acting for different purposes, such as family reunification" (IOM, 2019: 35-36). At the Law No 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection dated 2013 (12020), migration is identified as "regular migration as the foreigners' entry to Turkey and stay in Turkey and departing from Turkey with legal means and irregular migration as the foreigners' entry to Turkey and stay in Turkey and departing from Turkey with illegal means and unauthorized working in Turkey, and international protection".

In that scope, international migration is designated as the migration that is taking place across the boundaries of the country, in that context that such migrants are recognized as immigrants who have come to a foreign country and emigrants who have left their home country (World Economic Forum, 2017: 14). International migration is also identified as "the people's temporarily or permanently leaving their country of origin or their country of residence for settling in another country. So, there is a crossing of an international border" (IOM, 2019: 88). Moreover, the migrant definition by United Nations (UN) explained in Glossary of Migration Terms as "UN defined the migrant, as an individual residing in a foreign country for more than one year regardless of the reasons, volunteer or not, migration routes, being regular or irregular" (IOM, 2019: 37).

Besides, the migration management has been defined as "a management that is composed of the state institutions within the context of a national system to manage both the entry and presence of the foreigners within the borders of state, to manage the protection provided to refugees and the other persons in need of protection, to manage cross-border migrations in a regular and humane way. Migration management means a planned approach for the development of policies, legal and administrative arrangements to address key issues related to migration" (IOM, 2019: 36). The role of local governments at the management of migration is influential in tackling with the problems of migration. At the following title, local governments' role has been searched on migration at the international and national level.

3. LOCAL GOVERNMENTS' ROLE ASSESSMENT ON MIGRATION AT INTERNATIONAL AND NATIONAL LEVEL

3.1. Local Governments' Role Assessment on Migration at the International Level

At the ease of the integration policies for the population of migrants, regional and local authorities belong to critical roles, due to the fact that local governments have responsibilities concerning the cohesion of social and community (Lethbridge, 2016: 6). At the recommendation decision numbered 394 of Local and Regional Government Congress; it is clarified that "local and regional governments are the first institutions to be applied in an emergency as public officials, and they are responsible for providing access to basic public services (housing, health services, education) without discriminating newly arrived migrants" (item-2) (Council of Europe, 2017: 1).

Moreover, in the "Second Mayoral Forum on Mobility, Migration and Development Quito Outcome Document" (2015: 2), it was also elucidated that the rise at the international human mobility leads to new problems for local administrations. Moreover, at the World Cities Report (2016) in related to the new urban agenda, it is clarified that the new urban agenda is settled on five principles that also reveals shifts in the policy and strategic thinking such as providing that the model of new urbanization comprises procedures and mechanisms that preserve and endorse the rule of law and human rights; and providing equitable urban development and inclusive growth; civil society empowerment, widening the democratic participation and promoting collaboration; and endorsing environmental sustainability; reinforcing innovations that ease learning and sharing knowledge (World Cities Report, 2016: 180-181). It is seen that some of the principles of the agenda have strong ties with the issue of migration such as the terms as equitable urban development and inclusive growth and environmental sustainability, and local governments have a significant role in the realization of those principles at the local scale.

In that regard, in the OECD Report (2018: 24), it is clarified that migration policy is determined at the national scale but the integration policies towards the migrants are applied at the sub-national scale; and it is added that the integration has to be tackled with at the accurate geographical scale including neighbouring municipalities at the formulation of the best choices concerning the distribution of migrants in the time of their arrival, at the provision of service and transportation, and the precautions towards their prosperity and inclusion. Moreover, at the OECD Report (2018: 24), it is also clarified that local governments have to be a part in the scope of the multi-level governance concerning migrant integration and it is also added that localities should be taken into account as the partners at the policy dialogue of the national level concerning the integration targets and indicators, informing the alterations of the national policy via their experience on that issue. At that related Report, it is observed

that it is also mentioned that the localities should be considered as the partners in the policy dialogue of the national level.

In developed countries, local and regional governments, which are sub-national administrations, perceived as key stakeholders in related to international migration and in that context, local and regional governments are increasingly empowered (Daudov, 2015: 4). As it is seen at the above clarifications, at the international level, the local government came to the front side as a critical institution in related to the migration.

3.2. Local Governments' Role Assessment on Migration in the National Level

In the study, local governments' role in related to migration has been searched with using the document analysis method and critical documents on migration in related to migration in Turkey such as workshops, The Grand National Assembly of Turkey 'Migration and Cohesion' Report (2018) and Regional Refugee & Resilience Plans (3RP) covering from 2015 to 2020 in related to Turkey have been examined.

One of the major problems with Syrians in Turkey is related to local governments, and municipal administrations are maintained in the front row (Erdoğan, 2016: 34). It is estimated that there are more than 2.3 million Syrians living outside the camps, and between 300 and 500 thousand other asylum seekers; this issue has become a subject that municipalities should be busy, but there is no capacity and authority increase or any additional resource increase for the municipalities (Erdoğan, 2016: 34).

Many local services in the municipality's responsibility have ties with the municipal residents, migrants and refugees (Esen, 2016: 17). These services include those services as follows: "water and sewerage, transportation, burial and graveyard services, social services and assistance, marriage, gaining of profession and skills, and aids and services for women, children and disabled people, construction of a school building on condition that it belongs to the state, provision of tools and equipment, health care, cash and in-kind assistance for the support of sports, emergency aid, rescue and ambulance services" (Esen, 2016: 17). At the condition that, local administrations cannot render the needs of newly arrived refugees (employment,

shelter, basic human needs etc.), there will be the situations of local incompatibilities and problems at the local scale (Çakırer-Özservet, 2016: 48).

In that regard, the some of the studies of the municipalities regarding Syrians can be listed as; the formation of departments in related to migration or migrant studies by the municipalities, the efforts towards the employment of specialist personnel related to the migration, the works towards Turkish language education etc. (Adıgüzel and Tekgöz, 2019: 28-29). At that context, local governments in Turkey should play role on the issues of social inclusion and local cohesion because there are approximately more than 3 million refugees (Erdoğan, 2017: 43). In that scope, in the study some influential documents such as two workshops, Migration and Cohesion Report of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (2018) and Regional Refugee Resilience Plans (3RP): In Response to the Syria Crisis Turkey from 2015-2020 have been examined. In the study, the objective is to analyse the local governments, and especially the municipal administrations' role on migration, the main problem areas of local governments and solution proposals towards those problems.

3.2.1. Workshops, Reports and Plans Related to Local Governments in Related to Migration in Turkey

At this part of the study, the local governments' role related to migration has searched with using the document analysis method and critical documents on migration in Turkey have been examined.

Workshops, Reports and 3RP Plans	The Titles of Workshops, Reports and Plans
Workshop (2016)	Strengthening Coordination at Local Level in
	Migration Management
Workshop (2015)	The Role of Municipalities in Providing Service
	to Urban Refugees
The Grand National Assembly of Turkey (2018)	Migration and Cohesion Report
Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2019-2020	3RP Country Chapter
Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2018-2019	3RP Country Chapter
Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2017-2018	3RP Country Chapter
Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2016-2017	3RP Country Chapter
Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2015-2016	3RP Country Chapter

Table 1. Migration Related Workshops, Reports and 3RP Plans²

In the study, the Workshops, Reports and Plans that are demonstrated at the table above have been determined with the target to examine the roles of local governments related to migration through document analysis.

3.2.1.1. Workshops on Migration and Local Governments in Turkey

'The Strengthening Coordination at Local Level in Migration Management' Workshop, was held on November 7, 2016 by the hosting of the Şanlıurfa Metropolitan Municipality, and Şanlıurfa Metropolitan Municipality is the co-chair of the UCLG-MEWA Social Inclusion Committee (Workshop, 2016: 1). The workshop includes 150 participants from 55 institutions, including non-governmental organizations dealing with the studies such as migration, refugees and Syrians, local governments, universities carrying on studies in related to migration, and AFAD and Red Crescent (Workshop, 2016: 1).

In this sense, in the Report of the Workshop under the sub-title of 'Current Situation: Lack of Inter-Institutional Coordination'; it is stated that non-governmental

 $^{^{\}rm 2}$ In the study, those Workshops, Reports and Plans have been determined to examine the local governments' role related to migration.

organizations, central government institutions, private sector organizations and local government units, who participated in the workshop, declared that they did not communicate adequately concerning the issue of migration management, and it is added that they emphasized that the inadequate communication paved the way for a significant inadequacy in coordination (Workshop, 2016: 3). At that point, it can be clearly stated that at the success of the migration management, all parts in related to migration should be work in coordination and local governments should be seen as a partner at the solution of the migration-based problems.

Moreover, in the Report of the Workshop under the sub-title of 'the resource planning necessity', it is stated that "although the assistances from state revenue to the municipalities are transferred with taking into consideration of the population criterion on the issue of resource acquisition and allocation which is forming another one of the most important needs on the issue of the humanitarian aid planning and its effective delivery, not including the Syrian population in this calculation is the most noticeable issue" (Workshop, 2016: 4). On that ground, the solution proposal that is stated to be effective in solving the resource problem and facilitating the service provision designated as the realization of the transfer of resources provided by the state to the relevant public institutions and organizations and local administrations based on the distribution of Syrian people in the provinces (Workshop, 2016: 4). Besides, the other output of that related Workshop is demonstrated in the Report of the Workshop under the title of 'Syrian Migration Problem and Impressions' as making legal legislation sufficient and effective for foreign asylum seekers, as a proposal, it is designated that 'restructuring of local government laws and other relevant legislation including regulations on foreigners' (Workshop, 2016: 8-9). The other important output in the Report of the Workshop under the title of 'Syrian Migration Problem and Impressions' concerning local governments illustrated as the necessity of the planning of the humanitarian aid, and as a proposal, it is clarified that 'taking a decisive / complementary role of municipalities from local government units in the issue of planning humanitarian aid' (Workshop, 2016: 8-9).

Besides, the Union of Municipalities of Marmara organized a workshop on November 25-26, 2015 in Istanbul, titled 'the Role of Municipalities in Providing Service to Urban Refugees' within the scope of the cooperation of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, in Istanbul (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 3). 21 municipalities from Istanbul attended to the workshop, and the current situation related to Syrian refugees, refugees and migration issues were discussed, experiences and activities were explained to the participants and solutions proposals were submitted at the workshop (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 3). At the Report of the Workshop, some of the observations have been listed as follows (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 5-6);

a) It is elucidated that municipalities that help refugees base their activities for refugees on the national legal framework (5393 Law No-Item 13/ 38-n and Law on Foreigners and International Protection-Item 96),

b) The majority of the municipalities are declared as eager to provide services and to distribute assistance to refugees and it is also clarified that the municipalities are aware of the importance of coordinating the efforts with the different stakeholders in the city,

c) Many of the municipal assistances are elucidated to include winter aid: coal, blanket and stove, food/ supplies packages, hot food, clothing, household goods, and stationery aid for students,

d) It is also designated that there is no coordination and common standards that are pre-determined regarding the services and works for refugees among the municipalities,

e) It is also clarified that most of the municipalities emphasized that home visits and case surveys are very important to understand the general demography of refugees and to identify their needs,

f) Municipalities that create a database by developing software for Syrian refugees clarified to work more effectively within the framework of the provision of assistance to refugees (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 5-6).

In the Report of the related Workshop, regarding the problems identified, it is declared that "Municipalities do not know how to act on refugees and how to manage the process. Due to uncertainties in the legal, administrative and financial contexts, municipalities are getting worried in helping and working for refugees. In addition to the language barrier

affecting all services, social problems related to education and health services have been *identified*" (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 7). At that related workshop solution proposals have been developed and some of the proposals have been listed below (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 12-13);

• It is mentioned that a legal framework should be set up in the relevant legislation, with clear provisions on refugees in order to eliminate legal uncertainties that cause municipalities to have problems with refugee assistance and work, and it is added that these amendments should be able to clarify the issues such as; the provision of aid and services and the demonstration of expenditures in the budget,

• It is also elucidated that communication and coordination between relevant stakeholders should be ensured,

• It is also clarified that the information sharing platform should be established among municipal administrations with the target to share current information about the legal framework and good practices,

• It is pointed out that a common database in municipalities should be created to evaluate the needs of refugees and to prevent duplicate assistances, and it is added that it is necessary to use a software that includes tracking and mapping system for aids,

• It is clarified that municipalities need capacity building efforts regularly in those topics such as: informing about the national and international legal framework and legal developments, writing project, identifying the disadvantaged groups, obtaining financial resources and coordinating with other institution and organizations,

• It is also elucidated that vocational training activities can be held in related to refugees and vocational courses can be opened for refugees (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 12-13).

Consequently, it is seen that establishment of the legal framework, the provision of coordination between related parts, the formation of information sharing platform and formation of a common database in municipal administrations, the necessity towards capacity building for municipal administrations, organizing vocational training activities and opening of vocational courses are listed as proposals in the Report of the Workshop (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 12-13).

3.2.1.2. The Grand National Assembly of Turkey Report (2018) on 'Migration and Cohesion' and Local Governments

The Grand National Assembly of Turkey, Human Rights Investigation Commission, 'Refugee Rights Sub-Commission Report on Migration and Social Cohesion', it is clarified that municipalities provide services to Syrians such as food, clothing, blankets and other necessary goods, and aid collection campaigns are organized (TBMM, 2018: 263). At the Report, the municipal administrations' role has been explained as follows; having a role as a facilitator in the access of Syrians to public institutions such as health and education in their cities, and the establishment of a referral system to the hospitals, schools and relevant provincial directorates with this structure, which is set up by municipal administrations (TBMM, 2018: 263).

At the Grand National Assembly of Turkey Report (2018: 263), it is clarified that "today, within the scope of the migratory movements that have exceeded 4 million targeting Turkey, the role of local governments in the provision of certain services to migrants who settled in Turkey, temporarily or permanently should be reassessed. The fact that migrants of different status started to benefit from the city services offered by the municipalities together with the local people increased the roles and responsibilities of the local administrations regarding the migrants. Municipalities include particularly the migrants in need, in existing social assistance and protection services in line with their opportunities. However, there is no systematic and standard approach that is applied in all municipalities". It is seen from the clarifications that the increased roles and responsibilities of the local administrations concerning the provision of services for the migrants have been mentioned at the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (2018), Human Rights Investigation Commission, 'Refugee Rights Sub-Commission Report on Migration and Social Cohesion' Report.

At the Report, there are some clarifications that point out the municipal administrations and the migration in Turkey; those issues can be clarified under those sub-items as follows (TBMM, 2018: 263-264);

Zuhal Önez ÇETİN

a) At that Report, it is clarified that there are no clear expressions and provisions regarding migrants and asylum-seekers in the legislation of local governments, there are some provisions in which migrants can be indirectly related, such as Article 13 of the Law No. 5393 (TBMM, 2018: 263). It is determined that those following listed issues are important, such as the roles and responsibilities of the municipalities related to this issue should be clarified, should gain legal infrastructure, should be standardized, and the municipal administrations' capacities should be improved, for their sharing the burden on other public institutions and organizations as they are the first point of contact with migrants and for ensuring effective work at the local level (TBMM, 2018: 263).

b) At the Report, it is also emphasized to add the phrase to the Article 14 of the Municipal Law No. 5393 titled "The duties and responsibilities of the municipality", "municipality, with the condition that local common quality; a)... performs or have it made the cohesion services for migrants", and to add the phrase of "carrying out services on regular and irregular migration issues if needed" as clause (t) in the first paragraph of Article 15 of the same law is critical for those issues such as the addition the issue of migration and cohesion to the duties and responsibilities of local governments, clarification of the job description and ensuring the standardization of cohesion activities (TBMM, 2018: 264).

c) It is also elucidated that the density of the Syrian population has put pressure on local services and infrastructures such as water and waste management and it has led to the demand intensity in local social services, and it is also emphasized that the municipalities may experience financial difficulties in the service delivery process in the cities where there is a high number of migrants, it is clarified that the migrant or asylum-seeker population should be considered while transferring resources from the central budget, it is stated that, making an arrangement should be realized in the Law No. 5779 on Giving Shares from General Budget Tax Revenues to Special Provincial Administrations and Municipalities (TBMM, 2018: 264).

From the above clarifications, it is seen that the Report puts emphasis on the development of the capacity of the municipal administrations, adding the migration and cohesion themes to the responsibilities and duties of local administrations, the consideration of the population of the migrant in transferring resources from the central budget which are critical issues for local governments on the issue of migration.

3.2.1.3. Regional Refugee & Resilience Plans (3RP) From 2015 to 2020

3.2.1.3.1. Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2019-2020

In the Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2019-2020, municipalities are clarified as the first institutions to intervene to the effects of population growth, and it is pointed out that the rise in demand leads to problems in areas such as waste and waste management, public transportation and fire services and accessibility to services and infrastructure (3RPa, 2019-2020: 6). In the Plan, it is emphasized that 95% of the Syrians have been sustaining their lives with the host community who are under temporary protection that municipalities have taken an important role on the issue of meeting the rise in demand for services through taking their place among the institutions that first intervened to the impacts of the Syrian crisis (3RPa, 2019-2020: 7).

Besides, in the Plan, it is also elucidated that in addition to the requirement for basic services, the existence of refugees requires the new services' development at the municipal level on account of to meet social and protection necessities, and to ensure social cohesion among communities; and it is also designated that the opportunities should be created to the Syrians who are provided temporary protection at the processes of participation and in the formations of consultation with the target of their declaring of the demands concerning social, protection and social cohesion services and to develop dialogue with the local administrations and the host community (3RPa, 2019-2020: 7).

In the Plan, it is emphasized that recently, the 3RP support that is enabled for the municipal administrations can only provide 10% of the additional necessities and it is added that it is significant to support the areas such as the improvement of infrastructure and public transportation and also to strengthen the planning and budgeting capacities of municipal administrations' in the technical sense which is concerning with the raised service and infrastructure necessities (3RPa, 2019-2020: 8). In the Plan, it is also emphasized that the partners of 3RP will sustain their endorsement in related to the provision of special support towards the municipal administrations to improve their protection-based service provision (3RPb, 2019-2020: 18).

In the Plan, at the sub-title of 'Current Situation', it is determined that the municipal administrations having a high density of population, there is a significant rise in the usage of water and the volumes of waste that municipal services of the management of waste-water and waste are challenged in related to the provision of the necessary services (3RPa, 2019-2020: 64). In the Plan, it is also clarified that the coming of the Syrians who are under temporary protection also has an impact on the services of municipal administrations that are fighting with the raising operational cost related to the public transportation, wastewater management and waste gathering and also that are struggling with the augmented demand on municipal administration' resources, and it is elucidated that the partners of 3RP will provide endorsement on infrastructure and technical basis support to the municipal administrations that host the most Syrians with the target to meet the rising demands and to strengthen the service capacities of the municipal administrations (3RPa, 2019-2020: 66). In that related Plan, it is also mentioned that the partners of 3RP will enable more support towards the municipal administrations' operational and technical capacities and this support will be provided to encourage the effective and continuous service provision of municipal administrations (3RPa, 2019-2020: 66). Consequently, it is seen that in the Plan, it is dwelling upon the support of municipal administrations in infrastructure and technical basis.

3.2.1.3.2. Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2018-2019

In the Plan, it is designated that municipal infrastructure and services, including such as solid waste and wastewater management and firefighting services, continue to be challenged with the reason of an important rise in demand (3RPa, 2018-2019: 5). In the Plan, it is also pointed out that partners are going to raise their support towards the local institutions and authorities concerning the rendering of services at the municipal scale (3RPa, 2018-2019: 7). As it is seen from the clarifications, in the Plan, it is also dwelling upon the rise in demand related to local services providing by municipal administrations.

Moreover, in the Plan, one of the strategic objectives that the partners evaluated that centring on the objectives as necessary is designated as basic service delivery enhancement via national systems centering on strengthening state institutions' capabilities at the national, provincial and municipal level with the target to provide the necessities regarding service and focusing on setting up or improving infrastructure as required (3RPb, 2018-2019: 7).

In the Plan, it is also pointed out that the municipalities having high population density, there is a significant rise at the volumes of waste and the consumption of water (3RPb, 2018-2019: 68). In the Plan, it is elucidated that sector partners will carry on the required studies related to such topics such as to administer the pressure on the host community, to strengthen the environment concerning protection towards the Syrians who are under temporary protection, to develop the capacities of the providers of the municipal service and to provide assistance to the individuals who are vulnerable for meeting the basic needs (3RPa, 2018-2019: 71).

3.2.1.3.3. Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2017-2018

In the Plan covering the period, 2017-2018, it is emphasized that a central investment to be implemented towards the national and local administrations is the support towards the institutional capacity (3RP, 2017-2018: 6). In the Plan, it is also mentioned that those activities do not make advantages to the Syrians directly on the household level or individual level, it is stated that these activities promote social cohesion and the all protection reception conditions of the country of host and indirectly benefit the whole population (3RP, 2017-2018: 6).

In 'Strategic Directions And Response Plan' part of 3RP (2017-2018: 16), it is clarified that the sector is going to follow community mobilisation comprising local governments, municipal administrations, civil society partners and the communities of refugee. In the Plan, it is also pointed out that a focus is going to be based on local level engagement between Syrian refugees and the providers of service for targeting the necessities of the communities in a better way (3RP, 2017-2018: 52). It is seen that the Plan is focused on the institutional support towards the local administrations and community mobilisation and local level engagement.

In the Plan, it is also elucidated that 3RP partners are also going to promote the Ministry of Interior's and local administrations' capacity in terms of technical, operational and physical terms in order to provide municipal basic services in an efficient manner as a response towards the augmented demand (3RP, 2017-2018: 64). Lastly, it is observed that the Plan also focused on supporting local administrations' capacity.

3.2.1.3.4. Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2016-2017

In the 3RP Plan (2016-2017: 72), it is clarified that advocating the municipal administrations in rendering the basic local services is also emphasized as a precedence and, particularly the services that lead to increased risk on the health of the public as waste-management. In the Plan, it is also emphasized that the strategy of shelter and WASH³ (*water, sanitation and hygine*) is going to advocate the government at the sustenance of the appropriate conditions of, and reaching to the services and facilities in related to the hygiene and sanitation at the camps and in the municipal administrations where large quantities of refugees have been hosted (3RP, 2016-2017: 72). It is seen that the Plan is focused on the support towards the municipal administrations in the provision of basic local services.

In the Plan, it is declared that technical analysis has finished with consulting the municipal administration in order to designate the equipment necessities related to local waste management for strengthening the municipal administrations' capacities (3RP, 2016-2017: 81). It is also observed that the Plan also dwelling upon improving the capacities of municipal administrations.

3.2.1.3.5. Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP) 2015-2016

In the 3RP Plan (2015-2016: 10), in the title of 'Strategic Overview And Plan', one of the objectives related to Turkey is declared as to advocate government of Turkey and municipal administrations on the issues of construction, maintenance and development of community sanitary services and waste administrations systems at the urban fields and at the camps. In the Plan, it is also emphasized that the provinces

³ WASH is explained in the 3RPa (2019-2020) as water, sanitation and hygine (3RPa, 2019-2010: 68).

located along the border of Syria, the capacities of municipal administrations' are hardened on the basic necessities and waste management, it is added that a capacity increase has been required at the local level as to the raising population at the camps and urban fields (3RP, 2015-2016: 67). It is seen that the Plan has focused on the support of municipal administrations.

In the Plan, it is also emphasized that at the scope of the UNDP-UNHCR project in 2014, some of the municipalities had enabled with the emergency reply tools, and models related to the administration of waste are being formed for Gaziantep Municipality (3RP, 2015-2016: 67). In the Plan, one of the priorities in related to the basic needs sector is designated as the enablement of the winter clothes for the newcomer Syrian refugees, and the sustenance of WASH services at the camps and municipal administrations' technical assistance to rise those services at the urban fields (3RP, 2015-2016: 68). It is seen that the Plan is also focused on technical assistance to the municipal administrations.

4. CONCLUSION

In the research study, at the examination of the international level concerning the role of local governments on the issue of migration, it is observed that local governments have been clarified as the one of the first institutions that the people can be applied in an emergency and local governments have been also clarified as the institutions liable for rendering access to public services for the migrants (Council of Europe, 2017: 1). In the OECD Report (2018: 24), it is stated that local authorities have to be a part of multi-level governance concerning the issue of integration of migrant, in the Report it is also mentioned that the localities should be considered as partners in the policy dialogue of the national level. As it is seen from the clarifications, the local governments launched to adopt as an important institution on the issue of migration.

Moreover, at the study, document analysis has been made to examine the local governments' role on migration via the two workshops, 'Migration and Cohesion Report' of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey' (2018) and Regional Refugee &Resilience (3RP) Plans' Chapter of Turkey from 2015 to 2020. Firstly, in the workshop, titled "Strengthening Coordination at Local Level in Migration

Management", the problem areas of migration, which are also related to local governments, are highlighted at the title of 'Syrian Migration Problem and Impressions' (Workshop, 2016: 8-9). At that related part, the findings of the workshop pertinent to local governments are listed as; the need of planning of the humanitarian aid and making legal legislation sufficient and effective for foreign asylum seekers (Workshop, 2016: 9). Moreover, at the second workshop titled 'the Role of Municipalities in Providing Service to Urban Refugees' (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 7), the problems of local governments, and particularly municipal administrations are also explained with those clarifications "Municipalities do not know how to act on refugees and how to manage the process. Due to uncertainties in the legal, administrative and financial contexts, municipalities are getting worried in helping and working for refugees. In addition to the language barrier affecting all services, social problems related to education and health services have been identified" (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015: 7). As it is seen from the clarifications in the Reports of the Workshops in 2015 and 2016, various problems have been determined in related to local administrations such as humanitarian aid planning, not knowing of the municipal administrations the management of the process concerning migrants, language barrier, social problems related to education and health services (Union of Municipalities of Marmara, 2015; Workshop, 2016). Besides, the Grand National Assembly of Turkey Report (2018: 263-264) has dwelt upon such themes as follows; the clarification of the roles and responsibilities of municipalities, the addition of the issue of migration and cohesion to the duties and responsibilities of local governments at the Municipal Law No. 5393, and to consider the migrant or asylum-seeker population while transferring resources from the central budget.

Besides, Regional Refugee &Resilience Plans from 2015-2020 have significant clarifications concerning the local governments in Turkey and the issue of migration which can be summarized as follows;

a) In 3RP (2019-2020: 6-7), municipal administrations are clarified as the first institutions to intervene to the effects of population growth and it is added that municipalities have taken an important role on the issue of meeting the rise in demand for services. In 3RP (2019-2020: 8), it is pointed out that it is significant to support the

areas such as the improvement of infrastructure and public transportation and also to strengthen the planning and budgeting capacities of municipal administrations' in the technical sense. Lastly, in the Plan, it is also pointed out that the partners of 3RP will enable more support towards the municipal administrations' operational and technical capacities, and this support will be provided to encourage the effective and continuous service provision of municipal administrations (3RPa, 2019-2020: 66).

b) In 3RP (2018-2019: 5), it is clarified that municipal infrastructure and services, including solid waste and wastewater management and firefighting services, continue to be challenged with the reason of an important rise in demand. It is added that partners are going to raise their support towards the local institutions and authorities concerning the rendering of services at the municipal scale (3RPa, 2018-2019: 7).

c) In 3RP (2017-2018: 6), it is designated that a central investment to be implemented towards the national and local administrations is the support towards the institutional capacity. In the Plan, it is pointed out that 3RP partners are also going to promote the Ministry of Interior's and local administrations' capacity in terms of technical, operational and physical terms in order to provide municipal basic services in an efficient manner as a response towards the augmented demand (3RPa, 2017-2018: 64).

d) In 3RP (2016-2017: 72), it is clarified that advocating the municipal administrations in rendering the basic local services is also emphasized as a precedence. In the Plan, it is elucidated that technical analysis has finished with consulting the municipal administration in order to designate the equipment necessities related to local waste for strengthening the municipal administrations' capacities (3RP, 2016-2017: 81).

e) In 3RP (2015-2016: 10), in the title of 'Strategic Overview And Plan', one of the objectives related to Turkey is clarified as to advocate government of Turkey and municipal administrations on the issues of construction, maintenance and development of community sanitary services and waste administrations systems at the urban fields and at the camps. In the Plan, one of the priorities in related to the basic needs sector is designated as the enablement of the winter clothes for the newcomer Syrian refugees, and the sustenance of WASH services at the camps and municipal administrations' technical assistance to rise those services at the urban fields (3RPa, 2015-2016: 68).

Consequently, it is seen that the municipal administrations are evaluated as the first institutions that are dealing with impacts of population growth and it is also pointed out that they have taken a significant role on the provision of the increasing demands for services (3RP, 2019-2020: 6-7). Moreover, in 3RP Plans from 2015 to 2020, local administrations are mentioned to be advocated on those listed issues such as; to advocate the areas of infrastructure and public transportation and also to improve the planning and budgeting capacities of municipal administrations in technical sense, to advocate operational, technical and institutional capacities, to advocate on the issues of construction, maintenance and development of community sanitary services and waste administrations systems, the target of the support is declared to promote the effective and continuous service provision of municipal administrations, or to enable the basic municipal services in an efficient manner as a response towards the augmented demand (3RP, 2015-2016, 2016-2017, 2017-2018, 2018-2019, 2019-2020).

To conclude, the main objective of the study is to search the role of the local governments, and especially the municipal administrations on international migration in Turkey and in the study, via the document analysis method it is observed that the local governments, especially the municipal administrations on the migration issue, launched to be one of the main institutions in tackling with the problems of population growth in the local scale with the arrival of the migrants that local administrations' institutional, personal and technical capacities should be raised, and the local laws and regulations should be evaluated with considering the migrants. In that context, the municipal administrations come out as important institutions on the issue of the social cohesion and the provision of the local services to the migrants. At the success of the migration management, all parts in related to migration should be work in coordination and local governments should be seen as a partner at the solution of the migration-based problems.

REFERENCES

Adıgüzel, Y. and Tekgöz, N. (2019). *Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler Göç Yönetiminde Belediyelerin Rolü*, UCLG-MEWA Yayınları.

Council of Europe, (2017). "Kabulden Entegrasyona: Göç Olgusu Karşısında Yerel ve Bölgesel Yönetimlerin Rolü, Tavsiye Kararı 394", pp.1-3. <<u>https://rm.coe.int/168070b753</u>> (Accessed in 04.02.2020).

Çakırer-Özservet, Y. (2016). "Uluslararası Göç, Yerel Yönetimler ve Toplumsal Uyum" in *Belediyeler Sığınmacıların Yanında, İller ve Belediyeler Dergisi,* TBB, Ocak: 2016, Sayı. 813, pp.48-55.

Daudov, M. (2015). "Göç Politikasında Söylem-Eylem Dönüşümü ve Belediyeler", Türkiye Sağlıklı Kentler Birliği Kent ve Göç Konferansı, 14 Kasım 2015, Kadirli/Osmaniye. pp.1-16.

Ekşi, N. (2016). "1951 Yılından Bugüne Mülteci Kavramı" in Belediyeler Sığınmacıların Yanında, İller ve Belediyeler Dergisi, TBB, Ocak: 2016, Sayı. 813, pp.10-17.

Erdoğan, M.M. (2016). "Türkiye'deki Suriyeliler ve Yerel Yönetimler" in *Belediyeler Sığınmacıların Yanında, İller ve Belediyeler Dergisi,* TBB, Ocak: 2016, Sayı.813, pp.28-35.

Erdoğan, M.M. (2017). *Kopuştan Uyuma Kent Mültecileri: Suriyeli Mülteciler ve Belediyelerin Süreç Yönetimi: İstanbul Örneği,* Ocak 2017. Marmara Belediyeler Birliği. < <u>http://marmara.gov.tr/UserFiles/Attachments/2017/04/14/dcc6a30e-e9ed-4e99-920b-cdfa7544e370.pdf</u> > (Accessed in 16.02.2020).

Ertan, K.A. and Ertan, B. (2017). "Türkiye'nin Göç Politikası", İktisat ve Sosyal Bilimlerde Güncel Araştırmalar, Contemporary Research in Economics and Social Sciences, Volume.1., Issue 2, pp.7-39.

Esen, A. (2016). "Uluslararası Düzensiz Göçler ve Yerel Yönetimler" in *Türkiye'de Geçici Koruma Altındaki Suriyelilier: Tespitler ve Öneriler*, (Editörler: Adem Esen and Mehmet Duman), WALD Dünya Yerel Yönetim ve Demokrasi Akademisi Vakfı.pp. 11-41.

IOM (Uluslararası Göç Örgütü), (2019). Göç Terimleri Sözlüğü, Uluslararası Göç Hukuku. <<u>https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/iml31_turkish_2ndedition.pdf</u>>.(Accessed in 15.02.2020).

IOM UN Migration, (2020). World Migration Report 2020, <<u>https://publications.iom.int/system/</u><u>files/pdf/wmr_2020.pdf</u>>. (Accessed in 10.02.2020).

Kahraman, S., Tanıyıcı, Ş. and Kutlu, Ö. (2019). "Türkiye'de Yerel Yönetimler ve Yabancı Göçmenler". *Giresun Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi*, Yıl. 5. Sayı.10, pp.44-67.

Kahraman, B., Coşkun, Ö., Tunç, G. (2002). "Göç Olgusunun Değerlendirilmesi" in Kente Göç ve Yoksulluk: Diyarbakır Örneği, (Der. Prof. Dr. Melih Ersoy ve Doç.Dr. H. Tarık Şengül), Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi Kentesel Politika Planlaması ve Yerel Yönetimler Anabilim Dalı 2001 Yılı Stüdyo Çalışması, pp.25-48.

Lethbridge, J. (2016). "Migration And Local Authorities-Impact On Jobs And Working Conditions", A report commissioned by CEMR&EPSU. <<u>https://www.psiru.org/_sites/_default/files/2016-03-M-MigrationLocalauthorities.pdf</u>>. (Accessed in 10.02.2020).

OECD, (2018). Working Together for Local Integration of Migrants and Refugees, OECD Publishing, Paris. <<u>https://ec.europa.eu/regional_policy/_sources/docgener/_studies/pdf/</u>local_integration.pdf>. (Accessed in 16.02.2020).

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RPa), (2019-2020), Turkey: 3RP Country Chapter (Turkish) (3RP (Bölgesel Mülteci ve Dayanıklılık Planı) Ülke Bölümü: Türkiye), <<u>https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/68617.pdf> (Accessed in 20.02.2020).</u>

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RPb), (2019-2020), Turkey: 3RP Country Chapter, <<u>https://data2.unhcr.org/en/documents/download/68618</u>> (Accessed in 20.02.2020).

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RPa), (2018-2019), 3RP Regional Refugee Resilience Plan 2018-2019: In Response to the Syria Crisis TURKEY <<u>https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/63169.compressed.pdf</u>> (Accessed in 21.02.2020).

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RPb), (2018-2019), 3RP Regional Refugee Resilience Plan 2018-2019:InResponsetotheSyriaCrisisTÜRKİYEhttps://reliefweb.int/files/resources/63168.pdf(Accessed in 21.02.2020).

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP), (2017-2018), 3RP Regional Refugee Resilience Plan 2017-2018: In Response to the Syria Crisis TURKEY <<u>https://data2.unhcr.org/en/documents/download/53539</u>> (Accessed in 21.02.2020).

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP), (2016-2017), 3RP Regional Refugee Resilience Plan 2016-2017: In Response to the Syria Crisis TURKEY <<u>https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/</u> <u>Turkey RegionalRefugee%26ResiliencePlan20162017.pdf</u>> (Accessed in 21.02.2020).

Regional Refugee & Resilience Plan (3RP), (2015-2016), 3RP Regional Refugee Resilience Plan 2015-2016: In Response to the Syria Crisis TURKEY <<u>https://reliefweb.int/sites/</u>reliefweb.int/files/resources/3RP-Report-Overview.pdf> (Accessed in 21.02.2020).

Second Mayoral Forum on Mobility, Migration and Development (2015). The Local Agenda on Migration and Development. Quito Outcome Document. <<u>https://www.unitar.org/sites/</u><u>default/files/uploads/quito_outcome_document_en.pdf</u> >. (Accessed in 15.02.2020).

The Law No 6458 on Foreigners and International Protection, (2013). Dated 04/04/2013, Published intheOfficialGazetteon11April2013,Number:28615.<<u>https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.6458.pdf</u>>. (Accessed in 15.02.2020).

Turkish Republic Ministry of Internal Affairs, General Directorate of Migration Management, Turkey Migration Report 2016. (2016). <<u>https://www.goc.gov.tr/kurumlar/goc.gov.tr/Yillik Goc Raporlari/</u>2016_yiik_goc_raporu_haziran.pdf> (Accessed in 21.02.2020).

Türkiye Büyük Millet Meclisi (The Grand National Assembly of Turkey) (2018). Türkiye Büyük Millet Meclisi İnsan Hakları İnceleme Komisyonu Mülteci Hakları Alt Komisyonu, Göç ve Uyum Raporu. <<u>https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/komisyon/insanhaklari/docs/2018/goc_ve_uyum_raporu.pdf</u>>. (Accessed in 15.02.2020).

Union of Municipalities of Marmara (Marmara Belediyeler Birliği). (2015). "Kent Mültecilerine Hizmette Belediyelerin Rolü Çalıştay Raporu", 2015. <<u>http://marmara.gov.tr/UserFiles/Attachments/</u>2017/04/14/28b3e8d5-e08a-4f5a-a310-b3c71b91b23d.pdf

Workshop on The Strengthening Coordination at Local Level in Migration Management (Göç Yönetiminde Yerel Düzeyde Koordinasyonu Güçlendirme Çalıştayı), (2016). Şanlıurfa, Türkiye, <<u>http://uclg-mewa.org/uploads/file/73469fd6088f408ab471fd782592f_188/2016%_20%c3%87ALI%c</u> 5%9eTAY%20 RAPORU.pdf>. (Accessed in 12.02.2020).

World Cities Report, (2016). "Urbanization and Development: Emerging Futures", UN-Habitat For A Better Urban Future. <<u>https://unhabitat.org/sites/default/files/download-manager-files/WCR-</u>2016-WEB.pdf

World Economic Forum, (2017). "Migration and Its Impact on Cities", World Economic Forum Committed to Improving The State of the World, October 2017. <<u>http://www3.weforum.org/docs/Migration_Impact_Cities_report_2017_HR.pdf</u>>. (Accessed in 10.02.2020).